

Multiple Initiatives, One Framework: The Intersection of Initiatives, Data, and Metrics

By Katherine Leu, David Radwin, and Laura Horn

In this era of proliferating accountability and completion efforts, The Completion Arch™ provides a central resource to connect numerous initiatives, data, and metrics within one framework.

Renewed attention to higher education accountability and completion in recent years has resulted in the establishment of numerous initiatives aimed at community colleges. These initiatives provide many of the measures and metrics (operational definitions of measures), featured in *The Completion Arch™*. This research brief outlines the key characteristics of four such initiatives and describes how they are similar and how they differ for each of the core measures shown in the *The Completion Arch™* summary table.

The origins of the community college accountability movement can be traced back to regional accreditors' and states' demands for quantitative

measures of student progress and success in the mid-1980s (Ewell, 2011) and to the 1990 Student Right-to-Know and Campus Security Act (P.L. 101-542), which requires uniform reporting of institutional graduation rates (Cook & Pullaro, 2010). The last decade brought another wave of federal and state scrutiny (Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008; National Governors Association, 2010; U.S. Department of Education, 2006) and goals to substantially increase college completion from the Obama administration and organizations including the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, the Lumina Foundation, the College Board, and the American Association of Community Colleges.

The Completion Arch Summary: Core Measures and Data Availability

Measure	National		Number of states	State		ATD colleges ¹	ASAP colleges (MDRC) ²	
	National	Student characteristics		Student characteristics	States			
Enrollment								
Fall enrollment	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	—	—	
Unduplicated annual enrollment	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	—	—	
Developmental Education Placement								
Placement in developmental courses	—	—	5	—	VA, TX, MD, CT, CO	●	—	
Participation in developmental courses	T	●	31	○	CA, VA, NC, WA, CCA states*	—	—	
Progress								
Precollege Milestones	Completion of the first developmental course	—	—	2	—	CA, VA	—	—
	Completion of developmental sequence	—	—	27	○	NC, VA, CCA states	●	—
College Milestones	Enrollment in gatekeeper courses	—	—	1	—	VA	●	●
	Completion of gatekeeper courses	T	●	27	○	CA, NC, VA, WA, CCA states	●	—
	Threshold number of credits in specified time	T	●	3	○	CA, NC, WA	—	●
	Persistence over terms and years	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	●	●
Momentum Points	Completion of transfer curriculum	—	—	1	—	CA	—	—
	Full-time attendance in first semester	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	●	●
	Completion of courses attempted	T	●	3	○	CA, NC, VA, CCA states	—	—
	Specified credits earned within one year	T	●	4	○	CA, NC, VA, WA, CCA states	—	—
	Continuous enrollment	●	●	1	○	CA, CCA states	●	—
Summer credits earned	T	●	1	—	CA	—	—	
Transfer and Completion								
Graduation rates	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	●	●	
Number of degrees and certificates awarded	●	●	50	○	All states (IPEDS)	●	—	
Completion rates within six years	T	●	10	○	CA, CT, FL, NC, OH, TN, TX, VA, WA, WI	—	●	
Persistence without a degree after six years	●	●	7	—	CA, CT, FL, NC, OH, TX, VA	—	—	
Time to degree	T	●	30	○	IA, NC, VA, CCA states	—	—	
Credits to degree	T	●	29	○	NC, VA, CCA states	—	—	
Near program completion after six years	—	—	—	—	—	●	—	
Workforce Preparation and Employment Outcomes								
Licensure exam pass rate	—	—	5	—	MA (only RN exam), NC, OH, TX, WY	—	—	
Job placement rates	●	●	13	○	AR, CT, FL, IL, KY, OH, OR, TN, TX, VA, WA, WI, WY	—	—	
Graduates' wages and wage growth	●	●	15	○	AR, CA, CO, CT, IA, IL, FL, KY, OK, OR, TN, TX, VA, WA, WI	—	—	

● Available. ○ Partially available. — Not available or in development. T Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study, Second Follow-up (BPS:04/09) Postsecondary Education Transcript Study (PETS:09).

*Complete College America (CCA) alliance includes data from these states: AR, CO, FL, GA, HI, ID, IL, IN, KY, LA, ME, MD, MA, MN, MO, NV, NM, OH, OK, OR, PA, RI, SD, TN, TX, UT, VT, WV.

¹Achieving the Dream (ATD) colleges.

²Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) is a program operated by CUNY. Data come from an evaluation study of the program conducted by MDRC.

The responses to these recent actions include creation of the federal Committee on Measures of Student Success, charged with improving federal measures of community college graduation rates; the Voluntary Framework of Accountability (VFA), from the American Association of Community Colleges; and Complete College America (CCA), an outgrowth of the National Governors Association that became a separate organization. Other groups developed metrics and measures for institutional improvement, including Achieving the Dream (ATD), which collects and analyzes community college

student data; and the Community College Research Center (CCRC) of Columbia University, which articulated a detailed progression of research-based milestones and momentum points (Ewell, 2007; Leinbach & Jenkins, 2008; also see Offenstein, Moore, & Shulock, 2010). Related initiatives targeting community colleges include Completion by Design, which emphasizes data use to support institutional reform, and the Student Achievement Measure, which offers a more comprehensive accounting of student outcomes based on multiple data sources.

Reporting Meaningful and Relevant Data

All of these recent initiatives have focused on developing, collecting, and reporting student data that are more meaningful and relevant than earlier generations of measures and using these data to inform policy. Measures are more valuable to the extent that they:

- are updated regularly
- describe something that can be improved
- include as many students as possible
- can be compared across institutions and states
- are valid and reliable over time
- track students across institutions where applicable
- disaggregate values for different subgroups of students

Alleviating Initiative Data Fatigue

Keeping up with the growing number of initiatives and their diverse sets of metrics, measures, and policy recommendations has caused some community college leaders to experience “initiative fatigue” (Mangan, 2015). One of the goals of *The Completion Arch*[™] is to help alleviate this burden by providing a central resource that connects initiatives, data, and metrics within one framework and to illustrate how they intersect. To that end, this research brief compares the data definitions from CCA, ATD, VFA, CCRC and the U.S. Department of Education’s Integrated Postsec-

ondary Education Data System (IPEDS) and Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study (BPS), which comprise the major indicator definition and data sources in *The Completion Arch*[™]. The entry for each metric lists the associated indicator or indicators (what is measured), the cohort (who is counted), the time frame used, whether and how the indicators are disaggregated by subject or award type, and how the indicators are disaggregated by subgroups such as race/ethnicity, gender, or age category.

Topics (What is Measured?)

Whereas IPEDS includes the universe of post-secondary institutions and BPS represents the universe of institutions that enroll undergraduates, the other initiatives described here pertain to community colleges exclusively (ATD, VFA, and CCRC) or as a primary focus (CCA). As a result, they offer metrics on areas that are vital to understanding community colleges, though they are also relevant to four-year institutions. All the initiatives define enrollment for the purposes of constructing cohorts, although the IPEDS enrollment statistics, widely considered authoritative, are the only ones included in *The Completion Arch*[™]. The IPEDS measures overlap with those of the other initiatives on final

outcomes such as students' graduation rates, persistence across terms, and transfer rates. In addition to those measures, CCA, ATD, VFA, and CCRC all include intermediate measures of students' completion of developmental education, completion of gatekeeper courses, and credit accumulation, none of which IPEDS measures. Two initiatives, ATD and VFA, also measure long-term persistence in the institution. As for workforce preparation and employment outcomes, VFA is the only initiative in this group to define detailed metrics, though CCRC includes completion of apprenticeships and recommends measuring employment with state data.

Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted?)

A critical aspect of each initiative is the set of students each metric includes in its count. The current federal standard, which IPEDS uses, requires that graduation rates be reported only for first-time, full-time, degree-seeking students who enroll at the reporting institution in the fall. Whether a student is "degree-seeking" is defined by the institution. This cohort represents a small fraction of community college students.

The initiatives start from the federal standard but aim to expand upon it. Both ATD and CCA count most of their metrics on what ATD calls an "original cohort" consisting of a more inclusive base of all award-seeking students beginning in the fall of a given year, which is the same as the IPEDS fall cohort except that it includes part-time students. For certain measures, CCA uses a different cohort and includes different disaggregation subgroups, such as the number of credits completed before transfer, which is included in CCA's measures of transfer rates.

VFA and CCRC define several major student groups on which different metrics are counted. Each of VFA's progress and outcomes metrics

is counted on three cohort types. The Main Cohort consists of students who have completed high school, are new to the institution, and enrolled in classes during the fall. The First Time in College (FTIC) cohort, like ATD's original cohort, is equivalent to the IPEDS graduation rate cohort except that it includes part-time students. The Credential Seeking Cohort uses a different measure of "credential-seeking" than IPEDS does: it consists of the students who have earned 12 semester credit hours by the end of the second year of the tracking period.

Similarly, CCRC assigns students to groups based on two dimensions: the student's initial enrollment behavior and the student's ultimate program goal. For example, the first dimension includes a "developmental" group for those who enter needing developmental education, while the second dimension includes a "transfer" group for students whose goal is to transfer to a four-year college. For each group, CCRC defines different "milestones," or outcomes, and "momentum points," benchmarks that predict the attainment of milestones. CCRC restricts

its cohort to first-time students but, unlike the other initiatives, includes students who entered during terms other than the fall.

For certain metrics, the initiatives further restrict their cohorts to suit the metric. In its measures for developmental education and gatekeeper course completion, VFA counts only those students who demonstrate developmental need as defined by placement tests or other institutional referral procedures. (Community colleges that lack the capacity to identify students by developmental placement status are permitted

to use participation in developmental courses as a temporary substitute.) CCA restricts its measure of success in developmental education to those enrolled in developmental courses but does not restrict its measure of gatekeeper completion to those enrolled in gatekeeper courses, although ATD does. CCA includes separate graduation rate measures for students who seek each credential type: the initiative measures the percentage of certificate-seeking students who earned an award separately from the percentage of associate degree-seeking students who earned an award.

Time Frame Definition

Most of the initiatives specify time frames at which their metrics are counted. VFA and ATD generally group their metrics into “intermediate” and “final” categories, where intermediate metrics are measured sometime during the tracking period and the final metrics are measured at the end of the tracking period. VFA measures its intermediate outcomes after students’ second year of enrollment and ATD measures them at the end of the first, second, or third years. VFA and ATD both measure final outcomes at the sixth year. CCA and IPEDS both have numerous specific time frames that vary by metric and cohort. CCRC recommends that cohorts be tracked for five years after first enrollment. BPS tracks students for six years after initial enrollment, even those who enroll at multiple institutions.

The initiatives vary in the time frames they specify for each metric and sometimes include similar metrics measured at different times. ATD and CCA both have metrics for developmental education and gatekeeper courses at intermediate points in the tracking period. VFA requires colleges to report their developmental measures by the end of the sixth year, but reporting on de-

velopmental measures is optional for the second year. IPEDS, VFA, CCA, and ATD all measure persistence from the first to the second year, but only ATD and VFA measure it as a final outcome. VFA and ATD measure transfer rate both as an intermediate outcome and a final outcome, while CCA measures it at the end of every year over a period of four years, and IPEDS measures it within 150 percent of the program’s normal time to completion (the equivalent of three full-time years). VFA and ATD include both intermediate and final measures of graduation rates, while IPEDS and CCA both count the percentage of students who graduate within 100 percent, 150 percent, and 200 percent of normal time. BPS collects many student outcomes as of the end of the first year or the sixth year after initial enrollment and collects others more frequently within the six-year period.

Time frames are particularly salient for measures of credit accumulation, because the number of credits a student has accumulated by a certain point in time reflects their progress toward completion. At the two-year mark, ATD and VFA have the same credit thresholds: both initiatives

expect full-time students to earn 42 credit hours and part-time students to earn 24 credit hours. At the final six-year mark, 30 credit hours is a common benchmark, though ATD includes

only college-level credits and VFA also includes developmental education credits. BPS includes cumulative credits earned each year for the first through sixth year following initial enrollment.

Subgroup Disaggregation

Disaggregating data by student characteristics provides a clearer picture of the many different types of students attending community colleges. IPEDS disaggregates its graduation rates by gender and race/ethnicity, and its retention rate by enrollment status. However, every other initiative disaggregates or recommends disaggregating most metrics by a larger complement of subgroups, including age, race/ethnicity, gender, income, remedial status, and full-time/

part-time enrollment status. VFA and CCA both use students' Pell grant status as an indicator of income level. CCA includes transfer students in its disaggregation of student enrollment status. CCRC additionally suggests that subgroup data be collected on persistence and financial aid. BPS data can be disaggregated across many dimensions including race/ethnicity, gender, age, Pell grant status, and full-time/part-time status.

National Benchmarks

In addition to aggregating IPEDS metrics to the national level, *The Completion Arch*[™] includes longitudinal national benchmarks for many of the metrics described above using BPS data. BPS is a nationally representative cohort of all postsecondary students followed for six years

beginning in 2003-04 and ending in 2009. BPS also includes transcript data for all institutions attended from which credit-level detail are reported. The three-year outcomes for the new BPS cohort (enrolled in 2012) will be available in Spring 2016.

Conclusions

One of our ultimate goals is to encourage better collection and reporting of meaningful student success data—more inclusive, more detailed, more frequently measured, and more standardized—in these and other areas delineated by *The Completion Arch*[™]. While detailed data exist for many measures of student progress and success, data for other measures are inconsistently or

sparsely reported and are altogether nonexistent for others (Voight et al., 2014). A key asset of *The Completion Arch*[™] is the simplicity and flexibility of its framework, which can readily incorporate additional metrics (e.g., learning outcomes) and sources of data (e.g., State Longitudinal Data Systems) as they become available.

The Completion Arch Matrix

Enrollment											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Fall enrollment	IPEDS	Number of students enrolled for credit in the fall	All students enrolled for credit at the institution in the fall	1 year		•	•	•		•	
Unduplicated annual enrollment	CCA	Number of undergraduate students enrolled at public institutions of higher education within the reporting period	All undergraduate students enrolled	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	Number of students enrolled for credit at any point within the reporting period	All students enrolled for credit at the institution within the reporting period	1 year		•	•				

Developmental Education Placement											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Placement in developmental courses	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Number referred to developmental course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Math English Reading Any subject	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent of enrolled students who need developmental education	Students who require developmental education, based on referral/placement (or on coursetaking if necessary), within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years	Math English (equivalent to writing) Reading Any subject	•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of matrix tables

Developmental Education Placement *(continued)*

Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Participation in developmental education	CCA	Percent enrolled in developmental course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year	Math only English/reading only Both math and English/reading	•	•	•	•		
	ATD	Percent who attempted a developmental course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Math English Reading	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent enrolled in first developmental course	Students who need developmental education in respective subject within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years	Math English (equivalent to writing) Reading Any subject	•	•	•	•	•	
		Percent enrolled in any developmental course	Students who need any developmental education within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years		•	•	•	•	•	
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Number of developmental courses taken	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	1 year	Math English Reading Writing Other subject Any subject	•	•	•	•	•	
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Progress: Precollege Milestones											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Completion of first developmental course	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Percent who completed a developmental course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Math English Reading	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	Completing one developmental course in subject of need	First-time students who ever needed developmental education	5 years	Math Reading Writing	•	•	•	•	•	•
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Completion of developmental sequence	CCA	Percent completed all developmental courses and first college-level course	Credential-seeking students enrolled in developmental course in subject during first academic year	2 years	Math only English/reading only Both math and English/reading	•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	Percent completed highest developmental course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years	Math English Reading	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent completed highest developmental course in subject	Students who need developmental education in respective subject within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years	Math English (equivalent to writing) Reading Any subject	•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent completed all developmental education	Students who need any developmental education within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years							
	CCRC	Completing developmental sequence	First-time students who ever needed developmental education	5 years	Math Reading Writing	•	•	•	•	•	•
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Progress: College Milestones											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Enrollment in gatekeeper courses	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Percent attempted gatekeeper course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Math English	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Completion of gatekeeper course	CCA	Percent completed at least one entry college-level course	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years	Math only English/reading only Both math and English/reading	•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	Percent completed gatekeeper course or higher	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	3 years	Math English	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent completed any college-level course in subject of need	Students who need developmental education in respective subject within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years (optional) 6 years	Math English	•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	Completing a gatekeeper course in subject of need	First-time students who ever needed developmental education	5 years	Math Reading Writing	•	•	•	•	•	•
	BPS	Completion of gatekeeper math	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years	Math	•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Threshold number of credits in specified time	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Percent earned 42 or more credit hours	Full-time, first-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent earned 24 or more credit hours	Part-time, first-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent earned 42 or more credit hours	Full-time students within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent earned 24 or more credit hours	Part-time students within Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	Completing 15 and 30 college-level credits	"First-time, college-ready students First-time, transfer-seeking students	First-time students in vocational program"	5 years	—	•	•	•	•	•
			"First-time, college-ready students First-time students in vocational program"			•	•	•	•	•	
	BPS	Total cumulative number of credits earned	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	Every year up to 6 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Progress: College Milestones <i>(continued)</i>											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Persistence over terms	CCA	Percent enrolled both in next consecutive spring and next consecutive fall semester	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	Percent enrolled in next consecutive spring	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent enrolled in next consecutive fall	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent enrolled in next academic term	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 terms		•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Cumulative persistence through the end of the academic year	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	Every year up to 6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	Percent enrolled in next consecutive fall	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	2 years						•	
Completion of transfer curriculum	CCA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	See Completion rates within six years	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Progress: Momentum											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Full-time attendance in first term	CCA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Student attendance status during first term	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	First term		•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	Percent of students enrolling full-time in the fall	All students enrolled for credit at the institution in the fall	First term			•	•			
Completion of courses attempted	CCA	Percent of credit hours completed	Number of credit hours enrolled	1 year						•	
	ATD	Percent completed 80 percent or more of hours enrolled in	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent of credits completed	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent of credits completed with C or better	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent of credit hours completed	Number of credit hours enrolled in	First term 2 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Ratio of credits earned to credits attempted	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
Specified credits earned within one year	CCA	Percent completed 24 or more and 30 or more credit hours	Full-time, first-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
		Percent completed 12 or more and 15 or more credit hours	Part-time, first-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	Percent earned 24 or more credit hours	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	Completing 30 college-level credits in one year	First-time, college-ready students First-time, transfer-seeking students First-time students in vocational program	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
		Completing 30 vocational credits in one year	First-time, college-ready students First-time students in vocational program	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
	BPS	Total number of credits earned during first year of enrollment	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	1 year		•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Progress: Momentum *(continued)*

Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Continuous enrollment	CCA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Percent enrolled during all terms	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	3 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Number of stopouts at all institutions attended	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Summer credits earned	CCA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Total number of credits earned during summer terms	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years		•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Transfer and Completion														
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Disaggregation by								
						Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness			
Graduation rates	IPEDS	Percent completed formal award	First-time, full-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall		100%, 200% of normal time to complete									
		Percent completed formal award	First-time, full-time, credential-seeking students starting in fall		150% of normal time to complete	.	.							
Number of degrees and certificates awarded	CCA	Number of degrees and certificates awarded by program	N/A	1 year	Certificate of less than 4 years, associate degree, and bachelor's degrees				
	ATD	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—				
	VFA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—				
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—				
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—				
	IPEDS	Number of awards/degrees awarded by program	N/A	1 year	Certificate Associate degree Bachelor's degree	.	.							
Completion rates within six years	CCA	Percent earned award sought	First-time, certificate-seeking students starting in fall	100%, 150%, 200% of normal time to complete	Certificate of at least 1 but less than 2 academic years Associate degree Bachelor's degree				
			First-time, Associate degree-seeking students starting in fall											
	Percent transferred out, by number of credits completed before transfer	Entering students in fall term at two-year institution	1 year	12 or fewer credit hours 13-30 credit hours More than 30 credit hours without associate degree Associate degree				
	ATD	Percent earned degree or certificate	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Certificate Associate degree Bachelor's degree Diploma				
						Percent earned certificate prior to earning 24 credit hours	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year	
									Percent earned degree without transfer	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Award less than associate degree Associate degree or higher	.	.
						Percent transferred before earning 24 credit hours	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	1 year					.	.
									Percent transferred after earning an award	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	Award less than associate degree Associate degree or higher	.	.
						Percent transferred without award	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years						.

See notes at end of summary tables

Transfer and Completion (continued)											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to Cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Completion rates within six years (continued)	VFA	Percent completed formal award	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years	Certificate Associate degree
		Percent completed award without transfer	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	6 years	Certificate Associate degree Bachelor's degree
		Percent transferred without award	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years 6 years	
		Percent transferred after earning an award	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	6 years	Certificate Associate degree
	CCRC	Earning a certificate	First-time, college-ready students First-time students in vocational program	5 years	Certificate of less than a year Certificate of more than one year
		Earning an associate degree	First-time, transfer-seeking students	5 years	
		Transferring or being transfer-ready	First-time, college-ready students First-time, transfer-seeking students	5 years	
	BPS	Highest degree attained or enrollment status at last institution relative to first institution	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years	Certificate Associate degree Bachelor's degree
	IPEDS	Percent transferred out	First-time, full-time credential-seeking students starting in fall at a less-than-2-year institution	150% percent of normal time							
	Persistence without a degree after six years	CCA	—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—
ATD		Percent enrolled with 30 or more college-level hours	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	
		Percent still enrolled without transfer or award	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall	6 years	
VFA		Percent still enrolled without transfer or award	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	2 years 6 years	
CCRC		—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—
BPS		Highest degree attained or enrollment status at institution where student was enrolled in sixth year	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04	6 years	
IPEDS		—	—	—		—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Transfer and Completion (continued)											
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness
Time to degree	CCA	Average number of years to complete credential	N/A	N/A	Certificate of at least 1 but less than 2 academic years Associate degree Bachelor's degree	•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Elapsed time in months from entry to credential	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04 who attained a particular credential	N/A	Certificate Associate degree Bachelor's degree First award	•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Credits to degree	CCA	Average number of semester credits a student has accumulated when they earn a credential	N/A	N/A	Certificate of at least 1 but less than 2 academic years Associate degree Bachelor's degree	•	•	•	•	•	•
	ATD	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Near program completion after six years	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	Percent who were no longer enrolled and had not transferred or completed credential	First-time credential-seeking students starting in fall who earned 30 or more credits by end of second year	5 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
	VFA	Percent who left the institution but had earned 30 or more credit hours	Main Cohort, FTIC Cohort, and Credential-Seeking Cohort	6 years	—	•	•	•	•	•	•
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

See notes at end of summary tables

Workforce Preparation and Employment Outcomes												
Measure	Initiative	Indicator (What is Measured)	Assignment to cohort (Who is Counted)	Time frame	Disaggregation by Subject or Award type (where applicable)	Disaggregation by						
						Race/ethnicity	Gender	Age	Pell Grant status/Income	Part-time/full-time status	College readiness	
Licensure exam pass rates	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	Percent of students who pass a licensure examination on their first attempt	Students attempting a licensure exam for the first time who earned a formal award or completed a program in CTE or who left the college with significant experience in CTE within two academic years	1 year	For students enrolled in credit CTE programs: Certificate Associate degree Left/No award	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	Job placement rates	CCA	Average number of semester credits a student has accumulated when they earn a credential	N/A	N/A	Certificate of at least 1 but less than 2 academic years Associate degree Bachelor's degree	•	•	•	•	•	•
ATD		—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
VFA		—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
CCRC		—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
BPS		—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
IPEDS		—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Graduates' wages and wage growth	CCA	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	ATD	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	Change in median wage before and after CTE experience	Of those who earned a formal award or completed a program in CTE or who left the college with significant experience in CTE within two academic years, students who were not enrolled in further education and whose pre-CTE wages were above the quarterly minimum wage	From before program enrollment to more than 6 fiscal quarters after completion or last enrollment	For students enrolled in credit CTE programs: Certificate Associate degree Left/No award	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	VFA	Percentage of students who were enrolled, unemployed, or had earnings within five wage bands	Students who earned a formal award or completed a program in CTE, or who left the college with significant experience in CTE within two academic years	6 fiscal quarters after completion or last enrollment	For students enrolled in credit CTE programs: Certificate Associate degree Left/No award	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	CCRC	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
	BPS	Change in median annual salary	First-time students starting postsecondary education in 2003-04 who were not enrolled 6 years later and did not have future enrollment plans	From 4 to 6 years after entry	—	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
	IPEDS	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

NOTES: The initiatives have different definitions of “successful completion” of credits: VFA’s definition of successful completion is earning a C or higher (or being counted as “pass”). For developmental courses, ATD’s definition of successful completion is earning a D or higher, while for gatekeeper courses, “passing” is defined by the state. CCA leaves the determination of what counts as “passing” up to the institution. VFA and CCA report credits in terms of semester credit hours. VFA counts transfer to both two- or four-year colleges, while CCA counts only students who transfer from two-year colleges to four-year colleges. ATD measures transfer to a two- or four-year degree program for students who have transferred with an award less than an associate degree, but only counts transfer to a four-year institution for students who transferred with no award or transferred with an associate degree or higher. In 2015-16, IPEDS will begin collecting data on the outcomes, including completion, of part-time and non-first-time entering students as of 6 and 8 years after their initial enrollment.

Sources

Achieving the Dream

ATD: <https://achievingthedreamdat.zendesk.com/entries/21021117-Data-Dictionary>

Complete College America

CCA: <http://completecollege.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/2014-Metrics-Technical-Guide-Final-04022014.pdf>

Community College Research Center

CCRC: <http://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/publications/research-tools-2.html>

Voluntary Framework of Accountability

VFA: <http://vfa.aacc.nche.edu/Documents/VFAMetricsManual.pdf>

U.S. Department of Education's Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System

IPEDS: <http://nces.ed.gov/ipeds/>

Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study

BPS: <http://nces.ed.gov/surveys/bps/>

References

- Cook, B., & Pullaro, N. (2010, September). *College graduation rates: Behind the numbers*. Washington, DC: Center for Policy Analysis, American Council on Education. Retrieved March 31, 2015, from <http://www.acenet.edu/news-room/Documents/College-Graduation-Rates-Behind-the-Numbers.pdf>.
- Ewell, P. (2007). *Community College Bridges to Opportunity Initiative: Joint state data toolkit*. Austin, TX: Bridges to Opportunity Initiative and Community College Leadership Program, University of Texas at Austin.
- Ewell, P. T. (2011). Accountability and institutional effectiveness in the community college. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 2011(153), 23–36.
- Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008, P.L. 110-315, 122 Stat. 3078 (2008).
- Leinbach, D. T., & Jenkins, D. (2008, January). *Using longitudinal data to increase community college student success: A guide to measuring milestone and momentum point attainment*. CCRC Research Tools No. 2. New York: Columbia University, Teachers College, Community College Research Center.
- Mangan, K. (2015, March 10). Community colleges find new strategies to break through “initiative fatigue.” *Chronicle of Higher Education*.
- National Governors Association. (2010, July 11). *New NGA chair unveils college completion initiative*. News Release. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved March 31, 2015, from http://www.nga.org/cms/home/news-room/news-releases/page_2010/col2-content/main-content-list/title_new-nga-chair-unveils-college-completion-initiative.html.
- Offenstein, J., Moore, C., & Shulock, N. (2010, April). *Advancing by degrees: A framework for increasing college completion*. Sacramento, CA and Washington, DC: Institute for Higher Education Leadership & Policy and The Education Trust. Retrieved March 31, 2015, from http://www.csus.edu/ihelp/PDFs/R_AdvbyDegrees_0510.pdf.
- Student Right-to-Know and Campus Security Act, P.L. 101-542, 104 Stat. 2381 (1990).
- U.S. Department of Education. (2006). *A test of leadership: Charting the future of U.S. higher education*. Washington, DC.
- Voight, M., Long, A. A., Huelsman, M., & Engle, J. (2014). *Mapping the postsecondary data domain: Problems and possibilities*. Washington, DC: Institute for Higher Education Policy.

About the Authors

Katherine Leu is an education analyst in the Center for Postsecondary Education at RTI International.

David Radwin is a senior research associate in the Center for Postsecondary Education at RTI International.

Laura Horn is the director of the Center for Postsecondary Education at RTI International.

About RTI International

RTI International is one of the world's leading research institutes, dedicated to improving the human condition by turning knowledge into practice. Our staff of more than 3,700 provides research and technical services to governments, nonprofit organizations, and businesses in more than 75 countries in areas including education and training, surveys and statistics, international development, and economic and social policy. Our education and workforce development experts specialize in all levels from early childhood, elementary, and secondary education through postsecondary, adult, and career and technical education. We provide clear, unbiased, policy-focused research and innovative data tools for educators, policymakers, philanthropic organizations, and the public.

©2015 Research Triangle Institute. RTI International is a registered trademark and a trade name of Research Triangle Institute.

RTI International
2150 Shattuck Ave, Suite 800
Berkeley, CA 94704

www.rti.org/education